

Review

Reviewed Work(s): *Language, Thought and Consciousness: An Essay in Philosophical Psychology* by Peter Carruthers

Review by: Robert J. Stainton

Source: *Language*, Vol. 73, No. 3 (Sep., 1997), pp. 688-689

Published by: Linguistic Society of America

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/415952>

Accessed: 16-12-2024 13:53 UTC

---

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

*Linguistic Society of America* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Language*

Heidelberg: C. Winter, 1995. Pp. 261 and diskette.

This two-volume set offers a welcome exception to the familiar pattern of collected essays as assorted minimonographs more or less loosely organized around some theme or occasion. The fruit of more than four years of research at the University of Hamburg, directed by Braunmüller and supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, this set of essays offers a fairly comprehensive benchmark resource for future research on late medieval and early modern contact between speakers of Low German and the Scandinavian languages. The organization of the papers makes the material readily accessible to both specialists and serious non-specialists.

In volume I, Diercks and Braunmüller provide a useful overview of the larger research project which focused primarily on Low German-Scandinavian language contact in the fifteenth, sixteenth, and seventeenth centuries (9–40). MICHAEL ENGELBRECHT offers historical background for contacts between Scandinavia and Central Europe between 800 and 1600 (41–49). GABRIELA NIEPAGE discusses the reception of folk narrative (51–86), and LUDGER ZEEVAERT, the role of translations in establishing literary norms (87–136). B outlines the phonological and morphological conditions that facilitated the adoption of Low German forms in the Scandinavian languages (137–60), and D focuses specifically on prefixes and suffixes (161–94). PER WARTER demonstrates how a unified rule for word formation can be determined through automated parsing analysis (195–229). Finally, B shows how analysis of the noun phrase in two Low German folk narratives with broad proliferation across the Scandinavian linguistic territory raises larger issues of syntactic transfer (231–70).

In volume II, B presents a survey of language contact and variety during the height of the Hansa (9–33) as well as a second essay on the semiotic strategies of communication during the same period (35–70). Warter explains a computer model for lexical recognition (71–123) that complements the two essays of B, as does a paper by ERNST HÅKON JAHR on the nature of the Low German-Norwegian-Norse linguistic community of the Hansa (125–44). Zeevaert poses questions regarding the actual intensity of language contact (145–79), and TORBEN ARBOE ANDERSEN presents the results of research on

Low German loanwords in western Danish dialects (181–223).

Both volumes include excellent bibliographies and indices. As a stimulus to further research, volume II contains a disk with excerpts of the most important texts analyzed during the project. The diskette is especially useful in providing the context for a number of the essays in these volumes. [PHILIP E. WEBBER, *Central College, Pella, Iowa.*]

### **Language, thought and consciousness:**

An essay in philosophical psychology. By PETER CARRUTHERS. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996. Pp. xv, 291.

*Language, thought and consciousness* divides into roughly equal halves. In the first half, Carruthers considers whether natural language is merely a tool for communication between individuals or whether it is also, WITHIN the individual, a medium for thought. C adopts a version of the latter hypothesis: he argues that human thinking consists in sequences of natural language sentences; and that sentences don't merely encode thoughts, they constitute them. As a result, he says, philosophy of language and linguistics must be the foundational disciplines within philosophy and psychology, respectively. In the second half, C offers a theory of consciousness—essentially a version of the higher order thought (HOT) theory—according to which a conscious thought is one that the subject is noninferentially aware of having. Since the latter will be of less interest to readers of *Language*, I won't discuss it here.

C's book has several strengths. It highlights, and combats, the chronic antirealism about the mental which typically besets discussions of the language-thought relationship; it distinguishes the implausible claim that, as a matter of conceptual necessity, thinking occurs in language from the more sensible contention that, given our psychological make up, human thought constitutively involves natural language; and it explores in impressive detail both the introspective phenomenon of inner speech and the various forms of 'thinking aloud'. (Inner speech, says C, is a matter of 'imaging' rather than uttering a sentence.) Finally C faces squarely his principal opponent: Jerry Fodor, who famously contended that the medium of thought is Mentalese, rather than any natural language.

There are several problems, however. First, what at the outset appears to be an exciting hypothesis—each thought of mine is an English sentence!—becomes increasingly diluted: it is only occurrent conscious thoughts and propositional (i.e. not imagistic) thoughts which are embodied in natural language; and it is really the CLASS of all synonymous, fully interpreted, sentences-in-use, not particular syntactic and phonological sequences, which constitute thoughts; moreover, 'natural languages' may include simple, though articulated, gesture systems. Second problem: C argues that, while certain thoughts can be had both consciously (in language) and unconsciously, others can be had only consciously; but, as he admits, he doesn't attempt to say which kinds of thought must involve natural language—there is only the bare existential claim that some do. A disappointment. Finally, and most damaging, whereas one might expect to encounter lots of empirical work in this kind of book, what C mostly provides is arcane armchair philosophizing: no linguistics, and little psychology. For this reason, the book will be of much less interest to linguists than it otherwise might have been. Nor are the philosophical details always important or necessary. A case in point: much of Chs. 3 and 4 is a lengthy discussion—essentially otiose—of Fodor's various attempts at grounding Mentalese semantics. Worse, unnecessary philosophical details in one place are matched by overly superficial glosses elsewhere: issues like the innateness of folk psychology, metaphor/irony, connectionist approaches to reasoning, Quine on analyticity etc. In the end, the book suffers from its origins: it began as 'overview lectures' in philosophy of mind, and it shows. [ROBERT J. STANTON, *Carleton University*.]

**Korean.** By SUK-JIN CHANG. (London Oriental and African Language Library, 4.) Amsterdam & Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1996. Pp. xvii, 251.

This book is designed to serve as 'a brief introduction to Korean grammar' (xi), but it contains far more information and data than one normally expects from a brief grammar.

The first chapter, 'Introduction' (1–4), touches on a number of issues including the genetic affiliation, history, dialectology, and ty-

pology of Korean, and even the history of Korean linguistics. This chapter could perhaps have been expanded a little, given the wide range of topics that it deals with.

Ch. 2, 'Scripts and sounds' (5–18), examines the two concurrent writing systems (i.e. the native Korean Hankul system, and the Sino-Korean Hanca system). It also offers a glimpse of the sound system, phonological rules, and suprasegmental features.

Ch. 3, 'Words' (19–30), explains that the lexicon consists of Sino-Korean and native Korean words, the former outnumbering the latter by about 15% (19). Brief mention is also made of onomatopoeic words and foreign words borrowed mainly from English.

Ch. 4, 'Word classes' (31–67), discusses the two major groups of word classes: open (nouns, verbs, adjectives, and adverbs) and closed (particles, pronouns, adverbs, and interjections). In addition, both inflectional and derivational morphemes are exemplified.

The title of Ch. 5, 'Sentences' (69–133), is misleading in that it examines much more than the syntactic structure of simple sentences. Three major types of sentence structure are recognized: adjectival, copular, and verbal. Other minor patterns of sentence structure are also examined: pseudo- (or oblique) intransitive, multiobject, and locative transitive sentences. This chapter also deals with illocutionary markers, semantic roles, modification (both adnominal and adverbial), word order, different types and scope of negation, marked constructions such as passive and causatives, and tense, aspect and mood categories.

Building on Ch. 5, Ch. 6, 'Extended sentences' (135–73), discusses the syntactic structure of nonsimple sentences.

Ch. 7, 'Discourse' (175–212), deals with pragmatic concepts. It examines the sentence types from the perspective of speech act theory and the speech levels along with subject and object honorification. Topic and focus are seen to be two complementary discourse functions; how topic and focus interact with each other is illustrated in a painstaking manner. A short discussion is also provided of the reference tracking mechanisms in use. The book finishes with an appendix of six short texts (213–26), notes (227–38), references (239–43), and a subject index (245–51).

There are two features that could be taken to be shortcomings of the book. First, some parts of the book, e.g. semantic roles, tense, aspect,